





SIMULATION MODEL ACCREDITATION: An implementation guide

Basilio Puente Varela

Head of Conceptual & Basic Design, Techno Pro Hispania S.L.







Model:

• A *physical*, mathematical, or otherwise logical representation of a system, entity, phenomenon, or process valid only for a specific purpose.

Simulation:

• An "experiment" done over a mathematical model.

Accreditation:

• The official certification that a model or simulation and its associated data are acceptable for use for a specific purpose.





DANGERS OF NON-ACCREDITED SYSTEMS SAFETY AND MATERIAL LOSS





Dangers of non-accredited systems – Mars Climate Orbiter

 Model Specification: One of the NASA subcontractors had used English units instead of the intended metric system, which caused the orbiter's thrusters to work incorrectly. Due to this, the orbiter crashed almost immediately when it arrived at Mars in 1999.



Dangers of non-accredited systems – Boeing 737 Max

- <u>Independent Accreditation:</u> Since 2009 FAA delegates the accreditation to Boeing for their products
- <u>Hidden System Features:</u> MCAS existence was not notified to pilots





 Hackers <u>don't need have access to Digital Twin</u>, injecting an unexpected value in a sensor can produce a hangout in the system !

Accredited models are necessary for secure Digital Twins !!!



"Long product lifetime requires long term technologies"

Lifetime Cycles



LONG TERM ARCHIVING AND RETRIEV

LOTAR suggest the use of Modelica, FMI and SSP standards on simulation for Long-Term Archiving and Retrieval







MODELING WORKFLOW



IVV&A

Independent Verification Validation & **A**ccreditation

Tool-dependent source code



VERIFICATION AND VALIDATION OF SIMULATION MODELS, Robert G. Sargent







MODEL CLASSIFICATION

Model Types





SC: Standard Connector

connector Pin "Pin of an electrical component"
 SI.ElectricPotential v "Potential at the pin";
 flow SI.Current i "Current flowing into the pin";
end Pin;

PD: Proven Data

Data from experiments or measurements that was accredited for their use on models



RT: Real Time Model

Model designed to have a simulation time much faster than real time



MODEL CLASSIFICATION

Levels of Accreditation





CL: Model Credibility Level

Assigned on model quality assessment

CL0: No assessment is required.

CL1: Model performance, stability issues, submodel dedicated test, fault detection, etc... are not necessary.

CL2: Automatic test generator, fault detection, etc.. are not mandatory.

CL3: All main inspections are mandatory.

CL4: Highest level, all assessments are mandatory.

ML: Supplier Maturity Level

Assigned on process quality assessment

ML0: Undocumented processes changing dynamically without control.

ML1: Some processes can be repeated with consistent results.

ML2: Standard processes defined with some degree of improvement over time.

ML3: Processes with metrics, advanced experience on simulation.

ML4: Highest level, efficient processes, and highest experience on simulation.

Accreditation evels



MODEL CLASSIFICATION Accreditation Rules





1st The supplier ML shall be >= of the model CL

2nd CL shall be calculated as the lesser from model and subcomponent hierarchy used in the model. (inherited CL)

3rd Where a third party cannot audit or test extensively, the CL can be complemented with the supplier ML NOT RECCOMENDED

Example: A model is developed to have CL4, but it uses a component that has CL2.

On this situation, the model is assigned CL2, with a potential increase to CL4 after replacing the CL2 component and repeat the validation test .



MODEL CLASSIFICATION

Examples



X

✤ CL3, PM-WKPE, RT

★ : Developed under supervision of the signing third party.

CL3: Model Credibility Level

PM-WKPE: *Physics Model using Well Know Physical Equations*

RT: *Real Time capability*

In addition:

- Model scope to be included in model documentation
- Limitations implemented on the model
- Approved solver (embedded on FMU or into documentation) e.g.: DASSL, Tolerance: e-6, Max. Step: 0.01 s

Not Developed under supervision of the signing third party.

CL2, DM-ROM

CL2: Model Credibility Level

DM-ROM: Data Model using Reduced Order Model

Model Notation



not the





Target System

i	Minor	Significant	Severe	Catastrophic
High uncertainty that model does not represent relevant aspects of the reality	2	3	4	Not Trusted
Medium uncertainty that model does not represent relevant aspects of the reality	i	2	3	4
Low uncertainty that model does not represent relevant aspects of the reality	Ó	1	2	3
sense en la companya de la companya		🕻 en el la secta de la se		

Severity of consequence if function does not work as intended

Risk Assessment

Taken from DNV-RP-0513



Accredited Models Usage of



IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE Conceptual Model Validation



Define Model Scope

- Document intended purpose
- Select physics fields to be modelled
- Define input (variables and parameters) and output variables of interest and their accuracy needed
- Search for state-of-art theories and assumptions to be used

Conceptual Model Validation

- The theories and assumptions are well selected for the model purpose?
- The conceptual model covers the variables of interest needs?



Conceptual Model Validation
 document

Congreso Internacional

de Ingeniería Naval e Industria Marítima

Madrid, 24-26 abril, 2024 TRANSFORMANDO LOS OCÉANOS:

INNOVACIÓN e ingeniería noval para a munda CONECTADO y SOSTENIBLE

 Summary of Model Scope (theories, variables, assumptions, etc...) to embed into the component

Conceptual Model Validation





IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE Model Specification Verification



Simulation Model Specification

- Strategy of implementation:
 - **Divide and conquer**: Complex components shall be divided into smaller ones that need to pass individually all this accreditation. On this respect, the use of accredited components shall save a lot of effort.
 - KISS (Kept It Simple, St...id!):
 - Don't add unwanted extra functionality!
 - Don't add (or protect) extra variables!
 - Select the correct level of detail of the model!
- Efficient and Reusable code: Use Partial / Extended models Conditional components Replaceable components



IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE Model Specification Verification





Model Specification Verification



Simulation Model Specification

- 1. Select and justify the tool / language used
- 2. Breakdown the model into the optimum number of subcomponents / parts to be developed and connect them in a chart
- 3. Define all model connections and parameters
- 4. Define the functionality of each subcomponent / part
- 5. Define partial validations for each subcomponent / part
- 6. List all limitations of the model
- All the model requirements are implemented?
- The specification follows and develops the Conceptual Model?
- Are the variables of interest represented? Is expected to reach the required accuracy?



mplementation Verification Model





Model Implementation Verification



Model Implementation Verification



Model





DoublePendulumInitTip

ForceAndTorque

Validation Archiving

Model

- Include validation test to be shipped with the model 1.
- Create usage examples and document them 2.



IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE

Model Accreditation





Accreditation Metadata

Accreditation MetaData = { // Third Party that accredit the model {"AccreditationID", "E4R-324456"}, {"AccreditationBy", "Third Party Company"}, {"AccreditationAuthor", "Jane Doe"}, {"AccreditationRelatedSigns", "SIGN ID1, SIGN ID2, ... "},

// Model developer metadata {"Organization", "Developer Company"}, {"MainDeveloper", "John Doe"}, {"Contact", "john.doe@developercompany.ext"}, {"ModelLicense", "BSD 3-clause"}, {"DeveloperRelatedSigns", "SIGN ID5, SIGN ID6, ... "},

// Accreditation details {"DevelopedUnderSupervision", "YES"}, {"ModelType", "PM"}, {"ModelSubType", "WKPE"}, {"AdditionalNotation", "RT"}, {"CredibilityLevel", "3"}, {"DevelopmentCredibilityLevel", "4"}, {"MaturityLevel", "4"},

// V&V details {"ApprovedSolver", "DASSL"}, {"Tolerance", "le-6"}, {"MaxStep", "0.01"}, {"Tool", "OpenModelica"}, {"ToolVersion", "v1.22.1"}},



Document the Accreditation

Accreditation

Model Notation

CL3, PM-WKPE, RT

Approved Solver

DASSL, Tolerance: 1e-6, Max. Step: 0.01s, Tool: OpenModelica, Tool Version: v1.22.1

Model Scope

Model developed within the following scope: - No transitory heat transfer - Uncompressible liquids - etc...

Model Limitations

Contact:

Model License:

This model is limited to: - Pe < 0.2- etc...

Details

Accreditation ID: E4R-324456 Accredited By: Third Party company Accreditation Author: Jane Doe 18/02/2024 8:09:23 (Last signed date) Accreditation Date:

Developed By: Developer Company Maturity Level: Main Developer: John Doe

john.doe@developercompany.ext BSD 3-Clause

Accreditation Model



IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE

Model Accreditation

source code, making it inseparable

from the models



Sign & Stamp





Digital Signature

Several signatures can exist for the same component/part of a library.

The signatures are then embedded into –

_DigitalSignature = {
 {"SignID", "SIGN_ID1"},
 {"SignedBy", "Third Party Company"},
 {"SignAuthor", "Jane Doe"},
 {"SignTimeStamp", "18/02/2024 8:09:23"},
 {"SignCertificate", "Link to certificate"},
 {"HashAlgorithm", "SHA512"},
 {"HashValue", "3f2d0.....eab663e"},
 {"Signature", "0298e304f0.....7b718a"}});



IMPLEMENTATION GUIDE

What about IP protection?









Accreditation Process Chart

Archival





Basilio Puente Varela bpuente@tphispania.com

Thank you for your attention!